PHANTOM STOCK vs. ESOP

The Founder's Guide to Retention without Complication

The Problem: You want to reward key employees with "Skin in the Game," but you hate the idea of a messy Cap Table, complex SH-6 filings, and forcing employees to pay an "Exercise Price."

The Solution: Phantom Stock (SARs).
It mirrors the financial growth of your company's shares, without actually giving away equity.

The Comparison

Feature	ESOP (Employee Stock Option Plan)	Phantom Stock / SARs
What is it?	A right to buy **actual shares** of the company.	A right to a **cash bonus** linked to share price growth.
Employee Cost	**High.** Employee must pay an "Exercise Price" to own the shares.	**Zero.** No exercise price. It is purely a reward.
Voting Rights	**Yes.** Employees become minority shareholders (unless non-voting shares).	**No.** It is a contractual agreement. Zero interference.
Cap Table	**Cluttered.** Every exercise adds a new line item to your Cap Table.	**Clean.** No impact on shareholding pattern.
Compliance	**Heavy.** Requires Valuation Reports, Board Resolutions, MGT-14 filings.	**Light.** Handled via Payroll/HR agreement.
Tax Timing	**The Trap:** Taxed at Exercise (Perquisite) **AND** Sale (Capital Gains).	**Simple:** Taxed only once at Payout (Salary/Bonus).

The "Cash Flow" Reality Check
Why employees often prefer Phantom Stock

Scenario: An employee gets 1,000 units. The share price grows from **₹100** (Grant) to **₹500** (Exit).

🛑 **In an ESOP:**

1. Employee must **pay ₹100,000** to buy the shares.
2. Employee must **pay Tax** on the ₹400,000 paper profit *immediately* (even if they haven't sold).
3. **Result:** Employee is **cash negative** until a liquidity event occurs.

✅ **In Phantom Stock:**

1. Employee pays **₹0**.
2. Company pays employee **₹400,000** as a bonus (Appreciation).
3. Tax is deducted at source (TDS).
4. **Result:** Employee takes home pure profit. **Cash positive immediately.**

Strategic Advantage for Cross-Border Teams

If you have employees in the US/Singapore or Foreign Advisors:

- **ESOPs:** Trigger complex **FEMA Reporting**, Round-Tripping concerns, and Form FC-GPR filings.
- **Phantom Stock:** Treated simply as "Consultancy Fees" or "Bonus." No RBI reporting required.

Is Phantom Stock right for you?

It is the ideal instrument if:

1. You want to avoid diluting voting control.
2. You want to save your employees from the "Tax on Exercise" trap.
3. You want to avoid the administrative cost of managing minority shareholders.

Prepared by:
CA Adityavikram Banka
FEMA & Cross-Border Structuring Expert, Helping Founders Build Local & Sell Global.

📞 +91-9870777643 | ✉ info@asbanka.com

[Click Here to Schedule a Quick Call with CA Adityavikram Banka]